

DRAFT

COLUMBUS STATE

COMMUNITY COLLEGE

August 1, 2016

Dear Chancellor Carey,

Attached you will find Columbus State Community College's efficiency review based on the report and recommendations of the Ohio Task Force on Affordability and Efficiency in Higher Education, as required under Section 369.560 of the House Bill 64 of the 131st General Assembly. The attached responses are pending approval from the Columbus State Board of Trustees, which is expected in September.

The Task Force addressed many prudent efficiency measures within its recommendations. Providing students affordable opportunities to successfully earn degrees and certificates is a guiding principle at Columbus State. Our commitment to stewardship, affordability and student success is demonstrated by strategic partnerships, investments, and fiscal diligence, including the following:

FINANCIAL STEWARDSHIP AND EFFICIENCIES

- Forgoing tuition increases for 6 ½ years during the most recent recession, resulting in nearly \$30 million in tuition savings for our students and forgone revenue for the College.
- Maintaining the lowest in-state tuition rate of any non-levy community college.
- Releasing non-essential business services by selling our golf course, closing the child development center, and redeploying other assets to focus on our core mission of access, affordability, and completion.
- Developing extensive shared-services arrangements with strategic partners, including Reynoldsburg School District, Marysville School District, Columbus City Schools, Ohio University, Franklin University, and the Columbus Metropolitan Library.

MAKING COLLEGE AFFORDABLE THROUGH STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIPS

- Partnering with nine universities through the **Preferred Pathway** program guarantees admission for our graduates toward affordable 2+2 and 3+1 bachelor's degree programs. The College leads the State in the number of students earning certificates and transferring to four-year institutions. By completing freshman and sophomore years at Columbus State, Preferred Pathway students save 40% or more off a bachelor's degree.
- Partnering with more than 60 school districts in eight counties to offer dual credit opportunities allows students to fully realize the benefits of the State's **College Credit Plus** program. To advance the success of this program, the College allocated \$1 million in reserves to fund textbooks for *College Credit Plus* students in the first year of the program. This past autumn more than 2,400 students enrolled at Columbus State earning more than 11,200 credits. This is an increase of approximately 120% with student success

DAVID T. HARRISON Ph.D. **PRESIDENT**

DRAFT

rates exceeding 90% (demonstrated by obtaining a C or better and excluding withdrawals).

- Aggressively reducing textbook costs, saving students \$3.1 million since July 2012.

QUALITY ACADEMIC PROGRAMMING AND SUPPORT TO ADVANCE STUDENT SUCCESS

- Reducing achievement gaps for low income students and students of color. Initial data show that gaps have closed by 50% for low income students and 24% for students of color. These results have earned the College the distinction as an *Achieving the Dream Leader College*, a national designation that has been awarded to 19 community colleges committed to improving student success and closing achievement gaps.
- Reducing students' time to degree and remediation while insuring success through intensive advising, early alert interventions, and increased career services.
- Digitizing content in more than 45 course curricula and textbooks and creating digital objects grounded in proven learning theories designed to make course content more dynamic and interactive.
- Investing in competency based self-paced learning.

These initiatives are made possible through aggressive reallocations, prudent budget management, and implementation of new and more efficient processes, which have yielded savings or prevented large cost increases. For example, Columbus State's FY15 expenses were nearly flat compared to expenses in FY10, the year before adding a new campus in Delaware.

Our student success investments are showing promising results. Success initiatives often cost more, generate less revenue (or both) and require an ongoing investment for intended results to be achieved. Great gains have been made in removing barriers to student success, reducing achievement gaps, and making college more affordable, and we look forward to partnering with you to ensure that these gains will continue.

Thank you for your continued support in helping Columbus State meet the affordability and educational needs of our students and the workforce and civic engagement needs and expectations of the Central Ohio region. Please let me know if we can provide you any additional information.

Respectfully,



David T. Harrison
President

DAVID T. HARRISON Ph.D. PRESIDENT

DRAFT

Master Recommendation 1 | Students Must Benefit: Savings and/or new dollars generated from these recommendations must be employed to reduce the cost of college for students. Any other uses must have tangible benefits for the quality of students' education.

No response required.

Master Recommendation 2 | Five-year goals: Each institution must set a goal for efficiency savings and new resources to be generated through fiscal 2021, along with a framework for investing those dollars in student affordability while maintaining or improving academic quality.

See "Five-Year Goal for Institutional Efficiency Savings and New Resource Generation" template at the end of the document.

Section I: STRATEGIC PROCUREMENT

Recommendation 3A | Campus contracts: Each institution must require that its employees use existing contracts for purchasing goods and services, starting with the areas with the largest opportunities for savings.

Currently the College does not have the systems capability to track utilization rates of College contracts. Accordingly, Columbus State will survey other community colleges and determine their ability to track utilization rates and determine what it would take for Columbus State to have more detailed tracking. The College does, however, have data about the usage of the Inter-University College-Purchasing Group (IUC-PG) contracts and will analyze these data as well as overall spending to find additional opportunities for more efficient and affordable purchasing. In the short term, Columbus State will make the list of College contracts available to purchasers and encourage usage of these contracts.

Recommendation 3B | Collaborative contracts: Ohio's colleges and universities must pursue new and/or strengthened joint purchasing agreements in the following categories:

- Copier/printer services
- Computer hardware
- Travel services
- Outbound shipping
- Scientific Supplies and Equipment
- Office Supplies and Equipment

Columbus State makes extensive use of group purchasing contracts including IUC-PG, Educational and Institutional Cooperative (E&I), State of Ohio, US Communities and others, resulting in \$772,000 in lower costs that would not have otherwise been achieved in FY15. The College is currently reviewing and updating its Purchasing policies and procedures. Procedures now support bidding for goods or services centrally, which allows bids received to be compared to prices available through group purchasing organizations. The College will review its Purchasing policies and procedures to clarify under what circumstances the College can make the decision to not use a contract through a group purchasing organization without going to the College's Board of Trustees for approval, and under what

DRAFT

circumstances Board approval would be necessary. Any Purchasing Policy changes will be approved by Columbus State’s Board of Trustees.

Contract Type	Is the institution participating in joint contracts? [yes, no, plan to]	Include additional explanation here if needed. If the institution chooses not to participate, please explain why.
Copier/printer services	No	The college is currently under contract with Ricoh, which was competitively bid by the College after reviewing all available group purchasing contracts. The current contract expires in July 2017. In early 2017 the IUC-PG agreement will be reviewed.
Computer hardware	No	The College competitively bid computer hardware in the past year. Purchasing will work with IT when the next need arises and will review the IUC-PG agreement.
Travel services	No	The College does not contract with any travel agency and does not plan to in the future. The cost to hire a travel agency would make it prohibitive. The College has adequate staffing currently to handle travel needs in-house.
Outbound shipping	No	The volume of outbound freight is very low. The majority of College shipping expenses are incurred by the Bookstore that uses a group purchasing contract with discounted pricing.
Scientific supplies & equipment	Yes	The College is currently using the IUC-PG agreement for scientific supplies.

Section II: ASSETS AND OPERATIONS

Recommendation 4A Asset review: Each institution must conduct an assessment of its noncore assets to determine their market value if sold, leased or otherwise repurposed. Where opportunities exist, colleges and universities must consider coordinating these efforts with other Ohio institutions to reap larger benefits of scale.

Columbus State regularly conducts business planning to determine whether the College’s non-core assets should be sold, leased, or re-purposed. As a result, most of its underperforming assets have been eliminated over the last four years:

- Columbus State’s 9-hole Bridgeview Golf Course was closed in May 2013 and sold in June 2013.
- The College’s Child Development Center was closed in May 2013. The space formerly used for this program has been repurposed to align with College priorities, including *College Credit Plus*.

The College also regularly reviews leased space to ensure that locations and facilities are meeting the academic and workforce needs of the Central Ohio Region:

- In January 2013, Columbus State’s regional learning center in Reynoldsburg opened, bringing a new level of educational opportunities to the area. Co-located with Reynoldsburg High School (Livingston Campus), the Center represents a true shared service agreement including

DRAFT

classrooms, labs and a new Health Sciences lab. The agreement with Reynoldsburg City Schools allowed Columbus State to terminate two commercial leases for the Groveport and Gahanna regional learning centers which closed in 2013 and 2014 respectively.

- In September 2015, Columbus State moved its regional learning center in Dublin into the Integrated Education Center on Ohio University’s Dublin Campus where the College and Ohio University are establishing 2+2 Preferred Pathway programs.

The College will be upgrading its dining spaces in FY17 to transform its current café into a high-energy student learning environment, making better use of the space during non-meal times, as well as creating other smaller dining kiosks around the campus. Upgrades are also anticipated to provide partnership opportunities for enhanced services and offerings to students - including instructional opportunities for students in the Culinary and Hospitality program.

Over FY17 the College will complete intensive facilities’ assessments that include five components: Americans with Disability Act (ADA) compliance, Computerized Maintenance Management System (CMMS), Space Utilization, Building Needs, and Energy Master Plan.

Recommendation 4B Operations review: Each institution must conduct an assessment of non-academic operations that might be run more efficiently by a regional cooperative, private operator or other entity. These opportunities must then be evaluated to determine whether collaboration across institutions would increase efficiencies, improve service or otherwise add value.

As an institution whose enrollment peaked at 32,000 students in autumn 2011 and then experienced a 25% decline in enrollment the following autumn, Columbus State has managed its way through significant enrollment fluctuations. In fact, FY15 operational spending was essentially equal to FY10 operational spending, the year prior to opening a second campus which added approximately \$5 million in operating costs. This period of time included 6½ consecutive years during which the College did not increase tuition. Managing in this context required the College to constantly assess its business operations and its potential for partnerships.

For example, over the past year the College has extensively reviewed its purchasing processes to identify areas for potential improvements, which has resulted in using the Document Management System (DMS) to reduce costs of off-site storage, expedite processing by electronic routing of documents, and piloting the use of procurement cards (P-Cards) for many small-dollar purchases. The company, ADP, has been used for many years for processing payroll tax submissions and W-2’s, which is managed more efficiently given limited internal resources in this area. The College has also reviewed its method of providing transcripts to students resulting in a contract that is not only providing better services to students but also yielding savings to the College. Other operations that have been reviewed include enrollment verifications, financial aid, and human resource business processes.

Below are responses to each of the non-academic operations that the Task Force specifically identified be evaluated for possible outsourcing or operated through a regional cooperative:

Dining	Columbus State uses a private operator with expertise in dining services and has contracted out these services for over 25 years. While important to have food on campus for students, staff and visitors, dining services are not the College’s core mission, and therefore, a private operator can run the
--------	--

DRAFT

	operation more efficiently. Columbus State has bid its contract twice in the last 10 years.
Student Health Services	The College has not offered student health services for over a decade. For some time, the College had an agreement with an insurance provider to offer a plan with limited coverage but enrollment never reached levels for the program to be sustained. The program was not administered or funded by the college; students contracted directly with the insurance company. A subsequent attempt to attract another provider through an RFP process was unsuccessful (no proposals were received).
IT Help Desk	Columbus State runs its Help Desk in-house. Recently, the College engaged in a teleconference, led by Cuyahoga County Community College (Tri-C), to explore what other colleges are doing to gain efficiencies for these services. Columbus State is currently in the process of upgrading its platform for serving distance and digital learners and others who take courses outside the “normal” classroom schedule. The changes will allow self-service capabilities for students and employees to report problems 24 hours a day, seven days a week. This transition is expected to be completed over the next year.
Janitorial	These services are currently outsourced to a private vendor and will be re-bid in FY17. The College also uses services provided through the Department of Administrative Service’s Community Rehabilitation Program that assists State agencies and political subdivisions to purchase supplies and services offered by work centers which employ people with work-limiting disabilities.
Landscaping	These services are currently provided in-house.
Facilities Management	Columbus State’s Facilities’ staff manages the majority of maintenance needs and supplements as necessary with contracted services.
Real Estate Management	The College has limited real estate management needs. The majority of the work is managed internally.
Parking	The College self-manages its parking operations. A parking and transit strategy will be developed in the coming year.

The OACC CFOs meet monthly and have committed to review over the next year the operations identified by the Task Force to understand how each college addresses these needs, and the efficiencies/savings realized, to discuss whether regional cooperatives could be beneficial.

Recommendation 4C Affinity partnerships and sponsorships: Institutions must, on determining assets and operations that are to be retained, evaluate opportunities or affinity relationships and sponsorships that can support students, faculty and staff. Colleges and universities can use these types of partnerships to generate new resources by identifying “win-win” opportunities with private entities that are interested in connecting with students, faculty, staff, alumni or other members of their communities.

Columbus State is always looking for win-win opportunities with strategic partners and has a number of them that are academic, operational or both. Columbus State partners with nine four-year institutions through its Preferred Pathway Program. The College also has agreements with over 60 school districts in eight counties for the State’s *College Credit Plus* program. These partnerships are managed through the Central Ohio Compact: http://www.csc.edu/about/summit/pdf/CST-016%20CentralOHCompactBoard_3_1.pdf.

DRAFT

The College also partners with others for space and parking resources when these partnerships do not compete with the College’s ability to deliver its mission. Parking resources have been shared at the Columbus Campus with the Columbus College of Art and Design (CCAD) and the Columbus Art Museum. Other operational partnerships include is the College’s pouring rights contract and its partnership with the credit union and Education First.

A partnership between Columbus Metropolitan Library (CML) and Columbus State provides a “Columbus State Virtual Computer Commons” icon on the desktop of CML computers that enables students to work as if they are in a Columbus State computer lab. This is especially beneficial for students seeking access to Columbus State library resources and for distance learning students who may prefer to access their distance learning courses or other services available on the Columbus State network (library, shared drives, etc.) from any CML branch library, thus creating a “Computer Commons in the Community” throughout the city. Also, the library at Columbus State offers any of its students, faculty and staff the opportunity to obtain a CML borrower’s card at its library reference services desk. With proper identification, librarians can issue a card so that the patron may use all of the services of CML at any branch library.

A partnership between the Delaware County District Library (DCDL) and Columbus State provides equivalent services of a branch public library in Moeller Hall at its Delaware Campus Learning Center. Thousands of DCDL library books and videos and access to electronic resources are available to Columbus State students, faculty and staff, as well as community members who can also obtain a DCDL borrower’s card at the Columbus State Learning Center service desk.”

Partnerships/Sponsorships*	Description
Ohio University	Preferred Pathway 2+2 and shared space on OU’s Dublin Campus
Ohio State University	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Franklin University	Preferred Pathway 2+2 and 3+1, shared space at Columbus State’s Delaware Campus
Capital University	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Otterbein University	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Miami University	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Ohio Dominican University	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Ohio Wesleyan University	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Columbus College of Art and Design	Preferred Pathway 2+2
Columbus City Schools	Credits Count – a partnership with AEP and Columbus City Schools to work with students and their families in exploring STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Mathematics) fields and help students fill in learning gaps so that they are ready to study college-level courses while still in high school.
Reynoldsburg City Schools	Shared space and provides college student support services at Reynoldsburg High School (Livingston Campus)
Marysville School District	Early College High School

DRAFT

Seven Central Ohio high-poverty school districts	Investing in Innovation (i3) grant to support Early College High School implementation in seven high-poverty districts in Central Ohio that includes implementation of a standards-based early college high school curricula and a comprehensive professional development and coaching program
CCAD, Columbus Museum of Art	Parking
Over 60 Central Ohio School Districts in eight counties	Alternative Funding Agreements through <i>College Credit Plus</i>
Capital University, Central Ohio Technical College, Columbus College of Art and Design, DeVry University, Franklin University, Mt. Carmel College of Nursing, Ohio Dominican University, Otterbein College, Pontifical College Josephinum	Higher Education Council of Columbus Cross Registration Program (HECC) – enables full-time undergraduate students to attend any HECC home institution (where the student is registered full-time) to register at another HECC member host institution for certain credit courses not available at the student’s home institution.

*Columbus State has numerous partnerships; this is a sample.

Section III: ADMINISTRATIVE COST REFORMS

Recommendation 5A Cost diagnostic: Each institution must produce a diagnostic to identify its cost drivers, along with priority areas that offer the best opportunities for efficiencies. This diagnostic must identify, over at least a 10-year period:

- Key drivers of costs and revenue by administrative function and academic program;
- Distribution of employee costs — both among types of compensation and among units;
- Revenue sources connected to cost increases — whether students are paying for these through tuition and fees, or whether they are externally funded;
- Span of control for managers across the institution — how many employees managers typically oversee, by the manager’s function; and
- Priority steps that would reduce overhead while maintaining quality — which recommendations would have the most benefit?

Columbus State has a number of tools in place to monitor its spending, its revenue, and perform financial analyses. A multi-year trend report is regularly updated with enrollment, expenditure and revenue information. This report clearly shows that enrollment is the primary revenue driver.

In addition, the College has developed an Instructional Cost Model (ICM) where revenue and expenditures are allocated down to the course section level. The ICM has been used for many analyses over the years. For example, it was used when the College switched from quarters to semesters to ensure that changes were not resulting in an increase to students’ costs of attendance. It was also used when determining the financial viability of moving the regional learning center in Dublin to Ohio University’s new campus in Dublin. Most recently, the College has been reviewing how this information can be displayed in a dashboard format for faculty. To better inform this review, Columbus State reached out to Yavapai College in Prescott, AZ, who has a dashboard that uses benchmark information from the National Community College Benchmarking Project. This work has highlighted the fact that the biggest cost driver for instructional costs is the student-teacher ratio of a course. The plan is to finalize

DRAFT

the metrics for a dashboard over the next year and begin working with faculty so that this becomes a tool that informs their work.

Finally, distribution of employee costs is currently completed monthly and reviewed bi-annually in preparation for budget planning. The span of control for managers across the institution will be improved through the implementation of Position Control within the College's enterprise system.

Recommendation 5B Productivity measure: The Department of Higher Education developed a common measurement of administrative productivity that can be adopted across Ohio's public colleges and universities. While the measure should be consistent, each institution should have latitude to develop its own standards for the proper level of productivity in its units. This will allow, for instance, for appropriate differences between productivity in high volume environments vs. high-touch ones.

Columbus State has reviewed the initial Productivity Measure released by the Ohio Department of Higher Education. The results show Columbus State falling generally in the middle of the pack with regard to each measure while doing slightly better on the productivity measures than the efficiency measures. Having consistent benchmarks for the community college sector is critical in determining where improvements might be possible. Before conclusions can be drawn, however, it is important that the College gain a better understanding of how positions are assigned categorically through HEI by all community colleges so that the efficiency measures are comparable. Also, the cost of doing business from county to county is different which may drive costs higher in Central Ohio as opposed to more rural areas. The College will add this to its ongoing cost diagnostic work.

Recommendation 5C Organizational structure: Each institution should, as part or as a consequence of its cost diagnostic, review its organizational structure in line with best practices to identify opportunities to streamline and reduce costs. The institutional reviews also should consider shared business services — among units or between institutions, when appropriate — for fiscal services, human resources and information technology.

Columbus State has made some changes to its organizational structure over the past few years to better align leadership assignments to goals within each area. For example, Completion Advisors were moved from the Executive Office of Enrollment Management and Student Services to the Executive Office of Academic Affairs. Also, the dean position of Columbus State's Delaware Campus was broadened to include the regional learning centers at Reynoldsburg, Westerville, Dublin, Bolton Field, and South-Western at Grove City. Over the next couple years, the College will review its organizational structure in light of supporting its priority work around pathways for students in grades 9-14 who start their postsecondary work in high school.

DRAFT

Recommendation 5D Health-care costs: Like other employers, colleges and universities have experienced rapid growth in health-care costs. To drive down costs and take advantage of economies of scale, the Department of Higher Education has convened a working group to identify opportunities to collaborate. While no information on healthcare costs is required in this year's survey, please feel free to share ideas that the institution believes may be helpful for the working group to consider.

Any reforms considered by the State's working group should allow for choice and autonomy for each institution since there is no one-size-fits-all approach. Initiatives that have saved Columbus State on health care costs that the State's working group may want to consider studying include:

- Joining the Health Action Council (HAC): This collaboration has minimal cost per year but adds great value. Both public and private employers (i.e., Nationwide Insurance) can join. It provides purchasing power and economies of scale with autonomy. Columbus State had its health benefits, vision, and dental plans prior to the collaboration but were able to continue managing them along with the HAC contract – allowing the same benefits to be provided but at a lower cost. HAC also provides legislative updates, educational opportunities, and collaborative meetings where members work together for additional opportunities.
- Implementing a wellness plan program called “Health Rewards”: This program is optional to employees but those who choose not to participate pay more for healthcare. With a participation rate of 75%, this program has been effective at incenting employees to obtain recommended preventative exams that inform them about their health which in turn motivates healthier lifestyles.

Recommendation 5E Data centers: Institutions must develop a plan to move their primary or disaster recovery data centers to the State of Ohio Computer Center (SOCC).

Columbus State is moving its primary data center to the SOCC in FY17. This will be more cost effective for the College, free up valuable space for more student-centric purposes, and improve data security and mitigate risk.

Recommendation 5F Space utilization: Each Ohio institution must study the utilization of its campus and employ a system that encourages optimization of physical spaces.

The College's Board of Trustees adopted a master plan in July 2013. The plan focused on advancing the College's three strategic goals – student success, workforce development and civic engagement. The College serves students at its two campuses and is continually expanding its reach through partnership-driven regional learning centers, expanded access to technology-enhanced learning, and collaborative relationships with K-12 districts, colleges and universities, libraries, and other partners.

As part of the master planning process, utilization of current office and office support space was analyzed on the Columbus Campus, Delaware Campus and five of the eight regional learning centers at that time (two were exempted from the model as they did not have dedicated office facilities). Another review focused on scheduling and the use of existing classrooms and class labs at the Columbus Campus. This latter review helped the College to more strategically schedule courses, which in turn improved the utilization of space.

DRAFT

In 2013, Columbus State celebrated its 50th anniversary. Since its inception, the College has grown substantially with current facilities measuring approximately 1.8 million sq. ft. Since many Columbus Campus facilities are at, or exceeding 40 years of age, the College is seeing an increase in deferred maintenance every year. As already mentioned, during FY17 the College will complete intensive facilities’ assessments, one of which will be a Space Utilization Assessment.

Supplemental Recommendation 5G Energy Efficiencies: Seek to refine sustainable methods utilized by institutions to procure and use energy (resulting in more efficient use of energy), including, but not limited to lighting systems, heating & cooling systems, electricity, natural gas, and utility monitoring.

In 2008, Columbus State recognized that energy is a strategic business and operating issue, and committed to sustaining the environment for future generations. The College exceeded the goal established by HB 251 of reducing energy consumption by 20% by 2014, using 2004 as a base. This was achieved by replacing boilers, chillers and lighting, reducing printing costs, establishing recycling operations, reducing natural gas use, and implementing building temperature set-backs.

In FY17, Columbus State will develop an Energy Master Plan that includes an energy consumption assessment across all Columbus State locations to identify possible energy cost savings and the efforts needed to realize these savings. This plan will identify cost-savings measures, the costs of implementation and estimated return on investment.

What energy efficiency projects has the institution implemented or enhanced within FY16?

Project	Collaborative Partnership(s)	Explanation
Boilers, lighting, various HVAC upgrades		

Section IV: TEXTBOOK AFFORDABILITY

Recommendation 6A Negotiate cost: Professional negotiators must be assigned to help faculty obtain the best deals for students on textbooks and instructional materials, starting with high-volume, high-cost courses. Faculty must consider both cost and quality in the selection of course materials.

Columbus State established the Textbook Affordability Advisory Committee in 2011. Since July 2012, the work of this group has resulted in savings to students of over \$3.1 million. This cross-functional Committee is comprised of representatives from Arts and Sciences, Career & Technical Divisions, Instructional Technologies & Distance Learning, Bookstore, and Library. The Committee’s charge is to determine opportunities to reduce the financial impact to students resulting from the rising costs of textbooks and learning materials, and to act as a think tank for sharing best practices among departments learned through other regional and national sources. One of the standing sub-committees of this Advisory Team is the New Faculty/Student Orientation Sub-Committee which has a focus on textbook options and publisher relations.

Columbus State still operates its own bookstore with buyers who help serve as professional negotiators. These Bookstore staff work with faculty to educate them about negotiating textbooks costs. A “Faculty

DRAFT

Adoption” webpage has been developed to assist faculty with meeting their course material needs in the most affordable way and can be found here: <http://www.csc.edu/services/bookstore/faculty.shtml>

Recommendation 6B Standardize materials: Institutions must encourage departments to choose common materials, including digital elements, for courses that serve a large enrollment of students.

Columbus State is a leader in distance learning with the highest number of sections and enrollments in on-line education of all community colleges in Ohio. Academic departments continue to develop and enhance digital offerings and materials, which will result in more common use materials. Faculty are also being encouraged to adopt common materials in instances where digital material is not yet available. This work is currently in progress and will continue over the next several years. Specific emphasis will be placed on courses offered to *College Credit Plus* students (See response to Recommendation 6C).

Recommendation 6C Develop digital capabilities: Institutions must be part of a consortium to develop digital tools and materials, including open educational resources, that provide students with high-quality, low-cost materials.

The College partnered with several local school systems through State of Ohio *Straight A* grants to develop digital content for use in the high schools. The various partnerships provided the opportunity for the College to digitize content in over 45 courses. Columbus State was recently awarded a new *Straight A* grant for FY17 totaling \$929,446 to enhance student achievement through curriculum digitization. The College will collaborate with South-Western City Schools and Westerville City Schools to increase student achievement, improve access to pathways for in-demand jobs, and reduce textbook costs for *College Credit Plus* students.

Digital tools and supplemental materials will continue to be added for courses and the plan is to also offer specific programs in a digital format. A pilot program is underway in Columbus State’s Health Information Technology program and future learning platforms are being assessed.

Section V: TIME TO DEGREE

Recommendation 7A Education campaign: Each institution must develop a coordinated campaign to educate its full-time undergraduates about the course loads needed to graduate on time (two years for most associate degrees and four years for most bachelor’s degrees).

The College conducted a major *Take More to be Sure* communication campaign upon the conversion to a semester-based academic calendar. The campaign focused on the need for full-time students to take at least 15 credit hours per semester in order to stay on track for on-time graduation. Academic planning resources are designed to promote degree completion within two years, and students are provided guidance on full-time course scheduling through New Student Orientation programs and the COLS 1100 first-year-experience course required of all new degree-seeking students. Columbus State has updated the academic advising model to include completion advisors, embedded in each of three academic units of the College. These advisors work directly with students in academic planning and course scheduling to support on-time graduation.

DRAFT

Recommendation 7B Graduation incentive: Institutions should consider establishing financial incentives to encourage full-time students to take at least 15 credits per semester.

Columbus State has established *Crossing the Finish Line and Degree Completion* scholarships that students can obtain if they are nearing completion of a degree or certificate and have a minimum GPA of 2.75. The scholarships have assisted 60 students in pursuit of their educational goals since their inception in the 2013-14 school year.

Columbus State supports the idea of students being given assurance of their tuition costs if the objectives of continuous enrollment and timely degree completion are met. In fact, these objectives are built into the College's Technology and Facilities fee by exempting students from the fee who take 15 or more credits or who take courses over Summer term.

Recommendation 7C Standardize credits for degree: Institutions should streamline graduation requirements so that most bachelor's degree programs can be completed within 126 credit hours or less and an associate degree program can be completed within 65 credit hours or less. Exceptions are allowed for accreditation requirements.

The College has reduced the number of credits necessary to achieve an AAS degree to a maximum of 65 credits. The one exception is the Aviation Maintenance Program, which must meet Federal Aviation requirements. Programs are also developing clear plans of study for students to follow for their academic path. In addition, the College is in the process of developing full-time and part-time degree plans linked to advising and the degree audit system.

Additional work remains in preparation to further engage and define the College's work with Pathways, ensuring seamless entry into programs with little or no overlap and keeping elective choices to a minimum. Each academic discipline will focus on content that is necessary for workplace skill attainment. The College is leveraging grants like Investing in Innovation (i3), New Skills at Work, and Credits Count to remove barriers from students getting on a pathway to earn a meaningful degree or certificate as quickly as possible and avoid starting their career with high debt loads.

Recommendation 7D Data-driven advising: Institutions should enhance academic advising services so that students benefit from both high-impact, personalized consultations and data systems that proactively identify risk factors that hinder student success.

Columbus State has implemented Starfish Early Alert monitoring across the entire curriculum of the College. The Early Alert functionality provides both timely information to students at risk of not succeeding in their courses, as well as prompts for proactive outreach directly to a student from a Columbus State retention specialist. The College is currently exploring an enhanced academic planning platform, in conjunction with participation in the American Association of Community College's (AACC) Pathways initiative, and has recently enhanced tutoring and supplemental instruction systems in support of greater student success and attainment.

DRAFT

Recommendation 7E Summer programs: Each campus must develop plans to evaluate utilization rates for summer session and consider opportunities to increase productive activity. In particular, institutions should consider adding summer-session options for high-demand classes and bottleneck courses that are required for degree completion.

Columbus State is exploring how to fully promote Summer term to those who are pursuing a degree at another institution, but want to take a course or two over the summer to lower their costs. Emphasis will also be placed on outreach to *College Credit Plus* students and returning adults.

For Summer 2016, the College is increasing the number of popular general education courses with delayed starts to appeal to wider student audiences and their varying availability. Likewise, the number of web courses will be increased for similar reasons.

Also, Columbus State's Technology and Facilities fee is exempt to students who take classes during Summer term to incentivize students to take courses over the summer.

The College also utilizes summer to help students be better prepared for College course work. Columbus State has a Placement Test Boot Camp, which is a free three-day prep session where students work on mathematics, reading and writing skills, learn techniques to boost test scores, and take a placement test at the end of the session. A College Prep Math Course is also available to high school seniors who have not been successful in traditional high school math classes and are not prepared for college math. The course uses a series of online, self-guided modules, which allow students to move at their own pace and repeat lessons and exercises until the material is learned. When the students are ready, a test is administered to assess their learning and determine if they are ready to move on to the next module.

Recommendation 7F Pathway agreements: Ohio institutions should continue to develop agreements that create seamless pathways for students who begin their educations at community or technical colleges and complete them at universities.

Columbus State leads the State in the number of students receiving certificates and the number transferring to four-year institutions. Columbus State has 251 pathways to a bachelor's degree: four 1+3 agreements, 166 2+2 agreements, 76 3+1 agreements, and five 2+3 agreements. The College has successfully implemented this recommendation by working with more than 30 four-year institutions and with nine recognized Preferred Pathway partners: The Ohio State University, Ohio University, Franklin University, Otterbein College, Ohio Dominican University, Columbus College of Art & Design, Ohio Wesleyan University, Miami University, and Capital University. These partners afford benefits to Columbus State students beyond the transfer of credit (i.e., orientation, scholarships, etc.).

It is the College's process to first sign an institutional agreement, followed by program-to-program agreements. The foundation of these is a four-year plan of study that walks the student through completion of an associate's degree and then onto a bachelor's degree. In addition, this program allows students to pre-major in a four-year degree, access to advisors at their target university, and automatic acceptance into the four-year institution. Students save over 40% on the cost of a bachelor's degree with savings reaching close to 70% depending on the four-year institution and the pathway the student chooses.

DRAFT

The College's most recent effort to reduce time to degree for students is a partnership with Franklin University through the *EXACT Track* program, a new 3+1 evening and online program that allows students to earn a bachelor's degree in business in less than four years. *EXACT Track* provides comprehensive student support from both institutions, including free books and parking through the duration of the program.

Recommendation 7G Competency-based education: Institutions should consider developing or expanding programs that measure student success based on demonstrated competencies instead of through the amount of time students spend studying a subject.

The College is planning to accomplish this at the program level as well as at the course level. Nursing will be completely competency-based by Autumn semester 2018 and other programs are under review for moving to this format. At the course level, the plan is to develop general education and high enrollment courses into the competency-based format. A self-paced math course has already been developed that allows students to move through several developmental math courses within one semester by mastering skills at their own pace before moving into the next module.

Section VI: DUPLICATIVE PROGRAMS

Recommendation 8 | Course and Program Evaluation: Institutions should consider consolidating courses and/or programs that are duplicated at other colleges and universities in their geographic area.

Columbus State works to establish strategic partnerships with other educational institutions to benefit students and implement more efficient operations. For example, starting with the Autumn 2015 term, Columbus State moved its Dublin location to Ohio University's Integrated Education Center on its Dublin Campus. An operating team from both institutions meets regularly to review opportunities for cost efficiencies and communicates on how best to create a seamless operation to the public. Efforts have resulted in pathways for students that are more affordable and avoid duplications.

Other operational/academic partnerships that are benefiting students include: a new partnership with Franklin University through the *Exact Track* program, a new 3+1 evening and online program that allows students to earn a bachelor's degree in business in less than four years; a partnership with Reynoldsburg City Schools where the College's regional learning center is co-located with Reynoldsburg High School (Livingston Campus); and partnerships with Marysville School District and Columbus City Schools.

Section VII: CO-LOCATED CAMPUSES

Recommendation 9 | Joint oversight boards: The state should establish joint oversight boards between co-located community colleges and regional campuses of universities with a mandate to improve efficiencies and coordination while maintaining the differentiated mission of each.

Recommendation not applicable to Columbus State.

DRAFT

Section VIII: POLICY REFORMS

Recommendation 10A Financial advising: Ohio’s colleges and universities should make financial literacy a standard part of students’ education.

Columbus State has developed financial literacy content that is included in New Student Orientation programming as well as the COLS 1100 first-year experience course. Additionally, the College has recently opened *Student Central*, a one-stop holistic service center that can better address the broad financial wellness of a student.

Recommendation 10B Obstacles: The state Department of Higher Education and/or state legislature should seek to remove any obstacles in policy, rule or statute that inhibit the efficiencies envisioned in these recommendations.

Continued clarity and support through State legislation for *College Credit Plus* and 2+2 / 3+1 pathways would help remove obstacles to student affordability.

Recommendation 10C Real estate sales: State law should be updated to streamline the process for how public institutions sell, convey, lease or enter into easements of real estate.

No response required.

Recommendation 10D Insurance pools: State law should be clarified related to the IUC Insurance Consortium, which buys property and casualty insurance on a group basis for most institutions.

No response required.

Section IX: Cost Savings, Redeployment of Savings & Tangible Benefits to Students

Recommendation	Provide the actual FY16 cost savings <small>*Put NA if no savings</small>	Provide the actual FY16 cost avoidances
<i>Efficiency Practices</i>		
3A: Campus Contracts	Saved \$90,000 in copier/printer expenses by negotiating a new contract.	
3B: Collaborative contracts		Saved \$315,700 by using IUC-PG agreements. Saved \$44,800 by using State of Ohio contracts.

DRAFT

4A: Asset Review		
4B: Operations Review	Netted \$200,000 with new transcript contract	
4C: Affinity partnerships and sponsorships		
5A: Cost diagnostic		
5B: Productivity measure		
5C: Organizational Structure		
5D: Health-care costs		\$800,000 in costs avoided by being self-funded
5E: Data Centers		
5F: Space utilization		
Energy projects		
<i>Academic Practices and Policies</i>		
6A: Negotiate cost on textbook affordability	See below for savings realized by students but not the College	
6B: Standardize materials		
6C: Develop digital capabilities		
7A: Education Campaign		
7B: Graduation Incentive		
7C: Standardize credits for degrees	See below for savings realized by students but not the College	
7D: Data-driven advising		
7E: Summer programs		
7F: Pathway agreements		
7G: Competency-based education	See below for savings realized by students but not the College	
8: Duplicative courses and programs		
Low-enrollment programs:		
10: Financial advising:		
Other:		
Bad Debt	Additional \$400,000 in FY16	
Larger class sizes	\$400,000 Savings associated with 172 fewer sections due to larger class sizes	
Total Expected Annual Cost Savings:	\$1,090,000	\$1,160,500

DRAFT

Efforts to Reduce the Cost of College for Students or Provide Tangible Benefits for the Quality of Students' Education

Columbus State is consistently looking for ways to reallocate savings that either reduce the cost of college for students or provide tangible benefits to the quality of students' education. For example, for a 6-1/2 year period, coinciding with the height of the most recent recession, the College chose to freeze tuition and avoided assessing additional fees. During this time, approximately \$18 million in College reserves and \$12.1 million in FY15-16 State capital funds were used to meet ongoing technology and facilities' needs rather than passing those costs onto students. Over this time period, enrollment also dropped significantly as a result of the College transitioning from quarters to semesters and many older students going back to work in a recovering economy rather than pursuing a degree or certificate.

Columbus State, however, was able to continue investing in strategic initiatives that benefit students through aggressive reallocations, offering an early retirement incentive, defunding positions that became vacant, revising its financial aid processes that resulted in a reduction of bad debt, and realizing net income by adhering to conservative budget management principles. While investments were not traced to the specific savings that made each of them possible, the following are investments that have yielded cost savings for students attending Columbus State:

INITIATIVE	SAVINGS / EFFICIENCY IMPACT
Reduction of credit hours required to complete an associate's degree	From FY15 to FY16 the average annualized savings for a student to obtain an associate's degree was \$101.95 per student.
Textbook affordability	Students have saved \$3.1 million since July 2012, over \$774,418 saved in FY16. In addition, digitization efforts saved students in those courses the cost of a textbook, an average of \$60.
Incorporation of remediation in the coursework and curriculum of credit-bearing courses	Students taking English 1101 are estimated to have saved an average of \$408 by not having to take remediation courses.
Offering fast-track degree completion programs	It is estimated that students being granted credits toward their degree for prior learning saved \$982 on average and that students taking proficiency exams saved \$1,203 on average.

DRAFT

<p><i>College Credit Plus</i></p>	<p><i>College Credit Plus</i> allows high school and middle school students who are ready to take college courses at no cost to them. Dual credit enrollment at Columbus State increased by about 120% from Autumn 2014 to Autumn 2015, with similar increases in Spring term. These students took an average of 8.43 credits over the academic school year, which would cost \$1,146 plus the cost of textbooks had these courses been taken at Columbus State after high school graduation. The average cost for these credits at a four-year institution would be \$3,500 in tuition alone plus the cost of textbooks if taken after high school graduation.</p>
<p>Programs that have reduced or eliminated the need for remediation coursework</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Math 1099: It is estimated that students who take this course, a self-paced developmental math course allowing students to cover multiple classes, have saved on average \$408. • Math (ALEKS) Boot Camp: It is estimated that students who take this course save on average \$571. • Compass Boot Camp: It is estimated that students who take this course save on average \$816.
<p>Pathway agreements</p>	<p>Students who complete two years at Columbus State save at least 40% on a bachelor’s degree with savings reaching close to 70% depending on the four-year institution and the pathway the student chooses. The number of students who transferred from Columbus State to a Preferred Pathway institution within two years increased from 1,312 in AU12 to 1,494 in AU13 (the latest data available).</p>

Many of the above programs are either ongoing and the investments in them are continuing (as opposed to reallocations in FY16) or represent savings to students which are not specifically “on the books” of Columbus State. For example, a student who realizes savings for a bachelor’s degree through participating in Columbus State’s Preferred Pathway program are not savings that are realized specifically by Columbus State.

Columbus State is investing in a number of student success initiatives that have improved completion rates, reduced the time to degree, and improved success. Some of these success initiatives include:

DRAFT

Early Alert	This powerful success monitoring tool helps facilitate communication between the instructor, support services, and students. Early Alert gives students early feedback on course progress and helps the College offer early intervention to students at risk.
COLS 1100/1101	These courses provides students with an introduction to the College. It emphasizes skills and resources necessary to be successful in their personal, academic, and career-related pursuits and includes an orientation to College resources, policies, and processes.
Orientation and Transitions	A new student orientation, designed to help ease the transition from high school to college, as well as prepare parents and families for their student's new journey, provides students and families with information on the services Columbus State has to offer. In addition, students are able to participate in a group-advising session and register for their first semester of classes.
General One Trailblazers	This Columbus State organization supports students who are among the first in their family to earn a college degree.
Honors Program	Columbus State's Honors Program provides high-ability students in Arts & Sciences or Career & Technical programs the opportunity to join a community of like-minded individuals who desire the benefits of rigorous curriculum and heightened student and faculty interaction.
Placement Boot Camp	This program is designed to help students improve their scores on the placement test so they can enroll in college-level coursework.
Redesign of Advising	Completion advisors are now embedded within the three academic schools to provide students who have declared a degree path specific advice on how to complete their pathway on time.
Student Support Services/First Year Experience	In addition to the success courses (COLS 1100/1101), mandatory orientation, tutoring, a self-paced development math course, and pathway courses with embedded developmental content, the College also recently opened <i>Student Central</i> , a one-stop location where students can easily find answers and connect to the resources that they need. A number of positions within Financial Aid and the Registrar have been repurposed to direct student support in <i>Student Central</i> through implementation of more efficient processes in these offices.

These success initiatives and others are showing promising results. Initial data indicate achievement gaps for Pell students having closed by 50% and for students of color by 24%. These results earned the College the designation as an *Achieving the Dream Leader College*. Results are also showing that the more success initiatives that students participate in, the better they persist. For example, 37% of new degree-seeking, non-high school students, who participated in only one success initiative in AU14, were still enrolled in AU15, while 71% were still enrolled in AU15 if they were involved in five or more success initiatives.

MASTER RECOMMENDATION 2: FIVE-YEAR GOAL FOR INSTITUTIONAL EFFICIENCY SAVINGS AND NEW RESOURCE GENERATION

Category	Recommendation	Component	Description	FY 2017	FY 2018	FY 2019	FY 2020	FY 2021	Subtotal	Budget Narrative/Explanation of Efficiency Savings \$\$ (attach additional sheets if necessary)
Cost Savings	4B	Operations review	A newly negotiated contract for janitorial supplies and services	\$ 99,000	\$ 50,000				\$ 149,000	All the estimated savings are expected to be ongoing. For example, the savings for moving to P-cards is expected to save a total of \$15K in FY17 over FY16 and an additional \$60K in FY18 over FY17. It is expected that this \$75K in total savings over FY17 and FY18 will continue.
	6	Textbook Affordability	The College is committed to increasing affordability for textbooks and other materials over the next five years but the savings would be savings to the students, not the College. In fact these efforts actually reduce revenue to the College.						\$ -	
	Other	IT	Upgrades for 911			200,000			\$ 200,000	
		IT	SQL migration		291,000				\$ 291,000	
			Student printing	Improve student print management				375,000	\$ 375,000	
			Purchasing processes	Moving to P-Cards	15,000	60,000			\$ 75,000	
Subtotal Efficiency Savings				\$ 114,000	\$ 401,000	\$ 200,000	\$ -	\$ 375,000	\$ 1,090,000	
Category	Recommendation	Component	Description	FY 2017	FY 2018	FY 2019	FY 2020	FY 2021	Subtotal	Budget Narrative/Explanation of New Resource Generation \$\$ (attach additional sheets if necessary)
New Resource Generation	7E	Summer Programs	Assume 1.5% increase a year for non-transient students	\$ 163,200	\$ 165,700	\$ 168,100	\$ 170,700	\$ 173,200	\$ 840,900	Assumes increased enrollment and associated tuition and fees. (Tuition and fees are flat to FY16)
	Other	Retention rates	Increase retention rates from AU to AU and from AU to SP by 1 percentage point per year	\$ 122,500	\$ 120,300	\$ 130,500	\$ 130,500	\$ 130,500	\$ 634,300	This assumes new students each Autumn minus dual enrollment and transient students and would assume all other student groups are flat to prior terms.
Subtotal New Resource Generation				\$ 285,700	\$ 286,000	\$ 298,600	\$ 301,200	\$ 303,700	\$ 1,475,200	
TOTAL OF COMBINED INSTITUTIONAL OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENHANCED STUDENT AFFORDABILITY				\$ 399,700	\$ 687,000	\$ 498,600	\$ 301,200	\$ 678,700	\$ 2,565,200	

One-Time Resources	Other	Grants	Increase in outside grant awards	\$ 1,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 9,000,000	The College strives to leverage one-time investments to the College to improve academic and support systems to students
---------------------------	-------	--------	----------------------------------	--------------	--------------	--------------	--------------	--------------	--------------	---

SPECIFIC RE-DEPLOYMENT OF SAVINGS TO STUDENTS: Please use the area below to describe, in detail, how you plan to re-deploy the institutional resources that are saved and/or generated through the task force components outlined above to reduce costs for students.

Columbus State plans to redeploy savings to proven student success initiatives, systems upgrades and improvements that yield better services for students and staff, and other work that will support the College's priorities of student success, workforce development and civic engagement. Columbus State's strategic plan can be found here: <http://www.csc.edu/about/strategic-planning/>. All increased resources and reallocated savings will be aligned to this work. Columbus State is currently implementing an Action Project through its AQIP accreditation process called "Aligning and Communicating Strategic Priorities." Through this Action Project a new budget calendar was introduced that provided a heightened focus on aligning the College's resources with its strategic priorities.